

Original Research Article

Identifying the Effective Factors on Exploiting the Entrepreneurial Opportunities of Health Tourism in Mashhad

Sedigheh Mujtabaei ¹, Hassan Ali Pishbin ², Ali Khoshab ^{3*}

1. Master of Religious Tourism, Kheradgarayan Motahar Institute of Higher Education, Mashhad, Iran.

2. Lecturer at the Kheradgarayan Motahar Institute of Higher Education, Mashhad, Iran.

3. Lecturer at the Kheradgarayan Motahar Institute of Higher Education, Mashhad, Iran.

Received: 02/01/2022

Accepted: 27/03/2022

Available online: 21/04/2022

Abstract | Due to international sanctions and the Corona epidemic, tourism-related jobs in the metropolis of Mashhad have been more affected by other factors than other industries. The objective of the research: Leading research tries to investigate the factors affecting the exploitation of entrepreneurial opportunities in health tourism in Mashhad; In addition to the current situation, it can provide solutions in the future to improve this industry. Research Method: This research has been used to collect and analyze the findings using a combination of quantitative and qualitative methods and has been organized based on the combined sampling method. The data collection tool was interviews with 204 entrepreneurs in the field of health tourism, which was done using a semi-structured interview method. Since the data approach of the foundation was the basis of analysis, the effective factors identified in the form of 6 categories, 12 components, 16 indicators, and 66 identification codes, and the degree of the agreement was measured using the Thomas Cohen test. After confirming the findings, the researcher-made questionnaire was prepared and again provided to experts and entrepreneurs. After distributing and collecting the questionnaires, the data were entered in SPSS software and analyzed using Friedman quantitative prioritization test. The output showed that the most important priorities affecting the entrepreneurial field of health tourism in the city of Mashhad include the four main indicators of promoting entrepreneurship culture, public transportation management, education, and population. Finally, suggestions have been made to improve the health tourism situation of Mashhad from an entrepreneurial perspective.

Keywords | Foundation Data Theory, Entrepreneurial Opportunities, Health Tourism, Mashhad.

Introduction | There are many types of tourism today, and the superficial view that tourists travel solely for pleasure has been somewhat discredited; Sports, recreation, religion, or matters related to pilgrimage, environment, business, and many other things stand the motivations that people choose to travel; It is therefore widely acknowledged that there are complex reasons for individuals to travel (Lee, 2016).

For some types of tourism, travel offers a way to escape from everyday life and a good opportunity to relax and

experience a new culture. In health tourism, tourists primarily seek medical treatment and then create a more conventional tourism experience concerning leisure and rest in tourist destinations (Chowdhury, Prayag, Orchiston & Spector, 2019).

The culture of traveling abroad for cosmetic surgery has become a common practice, often accompanied by marketing and promotion in the form of media. Health tourism is often referred to as a unique form of tourism and as a luxury tourism concept that is also associated with leisure. Nevertheless, the combination of health and tourism seems to be a relatively new

* Corresponding author: :khoshab_ali@yahoo.com +989134484656

type of non-exclusive tourism. This type of tourism is expected to grow significantly in the next few years. This expected increase in health tourism is mainly due to the increase in the cost of medical care in more developed countries, the long-term waiting list for treatment, and the deterioration of health standards in many developed countries due to declining staff and increasing pressure on current treatment facilities. The aging population is also an important reason for increasing the level of health tourism now. On the other hand, globalization and information and communication technology have also increased the importance of hot springs, hiking tours (although they may also exist in sports tourism), yoga and meditation tours, health farms for weight loss, etc. (Brown, Smith & Assaker, 2016).

There is considerable research on health tourism markets, especially in Switzerland and Germany, which offer traditional services and spa treatment packages, which shows the importance of this type of tourism in different countries (Lee, 2016). In this regard "they are among the top ten countries in terms of weekly health tourism in Asia" (Health at a Glance, 2020). Unfortunately, despite the natural, historical and cultural capabilities of Iran, many opportunities in various branches of tourism have not yet been used to generate income.

According to the World Tourism Organization, Iran ranks fifth in natural attractions, tenth in historical and archeological attractions, twentieth in medicine and sixteenth in pharmacy. These statistics, along with capabilities such as the presence of entrepreneurial physicians in various fields, acceptable medical equipment, low treatment costs for tourists from neighboring countries, numerous hot springs and minerals, salt lakes, natural and medical sludges, deserts, and salt domes can make our country a destination. It becomes a health issue for regular tourists because, in addition to receiving medical services and gaining physical health by using natural attractions, people can spend their recovery period and regain the health of their souls (Moghimehfar & Nasr-Esfahani, 2011).

One of the main topics for achieving tourism development is to formulate a model of progress based on the talents, abilities, and facilities of each society, and society can not be excluded from being affected by its existential dimensions because entrepreneurship emerges. Entrepreneurship plays an effective role in socio-economic, industrial, and political development and on the other hand, is considered as the most important solution to the unemployment problem of university graduates (TRAM, 2008).

According to the statistics of the World Tourism Organization, for every 7 foreign tourists, one job is

created in each country, which is one job for every 4 people for health tourism (World Tourism Organization, 2019). According to the written plan of the Trade Development Organization and the Cultural Heritage and Tourism Organization, in the horizon of 1400 Iran should be able to attract 550 thousand health tourists every year and in the horizon of 1404 between 1 to 3 million people annually, in which case more than 137 thousand jobs in the country This way will be created and the country's income from attracting health tourists will reach more than one billion dollars (Rahmani, Arab, Saeedpour, Rajabi Vasoklai & Mirzaei, 2020).

Given the increase in the country's young population, the need to increase job opportunities and the need to increase non-oil foreign exchange earnings, attention to this area can be very helpful. The need to recognize and study the tourism potential of the region is of particular importance; therefore, while paying attention to its existing infrastructure to some of the effects and capabilities of tourism that can play an effective role in economic development.

According to the statistics of the Ministry of Health and Medical Education in 2018, this number was about 550,000 health tourists, but despite the epidemic and the weakening of the health tourism market, diagnostic-treatment centers and facilitation companies have faced financial difficulties; But in the wake of the Covid crisis, there have been good opportunities to build tourism infrastructures, such as convenient websites, virtual activities, admissions, and queuing system management, facilitation of international patient processes, and tourism entrepreneurship market policies, according to the Health Tourism Administration. The Ministry of Health in the first 9 months of 2019 about 125 thousand tourists have referred to diagnostic-treatment centers, but in the days of the disease (February 2019) to the end of June 2020, 250 thousand health tourists have entered the country, which is equivalent to 2 to 3 thousand dollars in It is estimated that \$ 625 million has been inflicted on the industry financially and that Iran is expected to lose 30% of this market. According to another report from the World Travel and Tourism Council, the ratio of Iran's tourism to GDP is 2/ 9 percent and direct employment is 2/ 2 percent, respectively, which represents 1,344,000 job opportunities. It has been about 5.4% of the total employment of the country. While the average share of tourism in the world of GDP and direct job creation (10.2% and 10%, respectively), these statistics show that the use of tourism opportunities in our country is not properly formed (Saeed Bakhsh, Kazemi, Nematbakhsh & Ranjbarian, 2020).

Meanwhile, Iran has the highest potential in the field of

health tourism among the countries in the region, and these problems can be observed and studied in all its provinces, including Khorasan Razavi and Mashhad. As the spiritual capital of Iran, Mashhad has 20 million domestic and foreign pilgrims annually, who have been destinations in more than 30 countries in the field of health tourism. This figure has always been increasing dramatically. In the meantime, Iraqi tourists are leading because of their proximity. In general, in recent years, with the normalization of relations between Iran and Iraq, the Iraqi people have welcomed travel to Iran, while previously traveling to Turkey and Jordan for further treatment. According to the Iraqi Consul General in Mashhad, in 2018, two million Iraqi pilgrims traveled to the city for pilgrimage, 200,000 of whom were treated as health tourists in the city's hospitals. In 1996, the total number of health tourists in Mashhad was 120,000. In addition to Iraqis, Afghanistan, the Republic of Azerbaijan, Turkmenistan, and the Persian Gulf countries, respectively, have the highest number of health tourists among Mashhad (Maleki & Tavangar, 2019).

Naturally, these people need a longer stay to recover. In addition, the countries of the Persian Gulf are accustomed to large family trips and generally rent a hotel or house for a long time, which leads to a demand for services and the formation of work and entrepreneurship in related fields.

The results of Rafiei Darani & Barati (2014) showed that the city of Mashhad creates a one percent increase in investment in the tourism industry equivalent to 15,316 jobs in the region, of which 534 jobs in the tourism industry (equivalent to 3.5 percent of total employment) will be created. Also, the employment created to increase the value-added of the tourism industry by one percent will represent a 58 percent share of employment in the tourism sector itself and 42 percent in other activities.

Given the spiritual and religious status of Mashhad, the population of more than 247 million Arab countries, it seems that health tourism in the city of Mashhad has not been able to activate all relevant opportunities and capacities, and this challenge has become more prominent in the field of entrepreneurial opportunities; According to experts in the field of health tourism in Mashhad, less than 50% of the capacity of health tourism in the country has attracted Rival cities in the region (including cities in Turkey) in recent years have a program to attract, exploit and employ in the industry. At present, health tourism in Mashhad has led to employment and direct entrepreneurship of more than 2000 leaders and employment of 1000 doctors, nurses,

and medical agents in 20 skin and hair clinics, 30 health tourism companies, 12 hospitals, and 2 surgical centers (Maleki & Tavangar, 2019).

According to many entrepreneurs, the metropolis of Mashhad has very good capacities in the field of health tourism, but these capacities have not been used properly in the field of tourism entrepreneurship; However, the existence of international sanctions and the Covid 19 epidemic has had devastating effects on the business and employment situation of entrepreneurs in recent years (2020-2021) and has affected the city's conditions for health-oriented tourism entrepreneurship. Therefore, the research tries to examine the factors affecting the exploitation of entrepreneurial opportunities for health tourism in Mashhad to provide solutions for the future to improve this industry in addition to describing the current situation, so the most important research questions are as follows:

- What are the institutional factors affecting the exploitation of entrepreneurial opportunities in the field of health tourism with a focus on the city of Mashhad?
- How is the role of each factor on the entrepreneurial status of the health sector in Mashhad analyzed and prioritized?

A Review of theoretical literature

• Health tourism

Health tourism has existed since ancient times and the third millennium BC. People in ancient Mesopotamia traveled to the temple of a god or goddess of healing in Tel Brock, Syria, to treat eye disorders. The Greeks and Romans also traveled by foot or boat to mineral springs across the Mediterranean, and today people from all over the world travel to the European Union for medical treatment and to create a market called health tourism.

Health tourism is a form of tourism that involves patients traveling to other countries for treatment or assistance. This includes all tourism-related services such as transportation, accommodation, and hospitality. Health tourism includes three categories: medical tourism, health tourism (to promote health), and spa tourism (spas that combine medical and health components). These three categories are different but they also have something in common. Health tourism is a broad concept and its meaning depends on culture and geography. In southern Europe, for example, health tourism is linked to the seaside, the Mediterranean diet, and the slower pace of life. In Scandinavia, the focus of health is on outdoor activities such as walking and swimming. Therefore, it can be said that the definition of health tourism is diverse and causes the overlap of different types of health tourism (Tsvetkov, 2018).

In general, the definition of health tourism is not clear and makes it difficult to include it in all types of tourism. As a result, measuring the importance, growth, and impact of health tourism on the tourism industry and the economy, in general, is also difficult. However, we know that the health tourism market has grown exponentially in recent years and has led to new forms of health tourism such as reproductive tourism and dental tourism.

• Tourism entrepreneurship

In recent years, the concept of “entrepreneurship” has been adopted as a field related to management research. Recently, a growing number of researches on various aspects of entrepreneurship and a comprehensive understanding of the term have been conducted, thus providing suitable preconditions for entrepreneurship as an independent field of research.

In an analysis of the progress of entrepreneurial research published between 1985 and 2009, Bozintz et al. argue that the field is emerging academically. According to Sorensen’s view, it is recommended to study the entrepreneurial process as a dynamic phenomenon that is formed in a broader context of individual and social conceptual construction. Major topics in the field of entrepreneurship studies are widely explored, while other topics still need further research (Buznitz, Plummer, Klotz, Shahzad & Rhoads, 2014). In the very early stages of entrepreneurship research, Carland et al. made a distinction between entrepreneurship and small business. Several studies have examined the nature, goals, and characteristics of entrepreneurship. In this context, the importance of culture and the impact of cultural factors on entrepreneurial intent has also been examined. On the other hand, over the past two decades, the concept of innovation has been used in tourism entrepreneurship research (Carland et al, 1984).

“Five important categories of tourism innovations help to search for the main factors in this innovative behavior. In addition, some studies, on the relationship between entrepreneurship, innovation, have analyzed quality performance and economic growth. Another stream of research is devoted to so-called “social capital” (Ram & Barrett, 2020).

In this research, an attempt has been made to use opportunity-based entrepreneurship theory. In this theory, after identifying suitable opportunities and before deciding to enter the market and take advantage of the opportunity, by spending time and gathering information, they reduce uncertainty and create company resources and capabilities. The first importer refers to before competitors enter the industry. Prolonging the time it takes to do a job can provide important performance benefits, including helping to strengthen a

company’s brand, expanding its product line, achieving cost benefits through the effects of experience, and maintaining higher profit margins in the absence of competitive pricing. Here, the entrepreneur tries to come up with a solution to fill the gaps caused by need, problem, or demand by presenting the right idea. In the next stage, by evaluating and weighing innovative ideas and finally screening them, it chooses the best available solution or the best idea (Kirzner, 1979).

• Entrepreneurship in the health tourism industry of Mashhad

According to estimates, more than 200,000 health tourists enter Iran annually, among which Khorasan Razavi is a pioneer in attracting health tourists with different attractions and capacities. About three million foreign pilgrims and travelers travel to Mashhad annually, and this shows the increasing capacity of this area. According to the report of the Khorasan Razavi Health Professional Tourism Association, in 2020, the city of Mashhad after Tehran has the most health tourists in the country.

Currently, 12 hospitals and three limited surgery centers have licenses to receive health tourists in Mashhad, and four hospitals and four limited surgery centers are in the final stages of obtaining the relevant licenses, and issuing 1,100 temporary licenses for translators and health tourism guides in this province. To eliminate intermediaries in the field of health tourism, along with planning for training and organizing, has been started. This project is being implemented for guides and translators of Arabic, Russian, English, and French languages, and in addition, a training program for staff of medical centers and health tourism companies and pilgrim guides of Mashhad Municipality counters is also on the agenda, so far more than a thousand people in this Registered field (Rafiei & Ghamkhar, 2016).

Research method

The present research is applied in terms of purpose and hybrid in nature. The field of data collection uses a qualitative-quantitative research approach and the most important qualitative method for data collection in this study is text analysis using articles and interviews that have been taken and in the field of quantitative data collection from researcher-made questionnaires, Quality has been achieved.

To answer the research questions, a survey-analytical method has been used. Quantitative data were collected through a questionnaire and qualitative data were collected through interviews and direct observation regarding the role of entrepreneurs in tourism development.

Given that the study population included experts (health

tourists); Therefore, to perform sampling, first, the list of the target population was compiled (Table 1), and then based on qualitative (interview) and quantitative sampling methods (questionnaire distribution), the samples were adjusted:

After compiling the list of the research community, finally, the number of sample members, the type of sampling, the sampling technique, and the duration of each member have been compiled according to Table 1.

The best method for adopting the sample was considered in the interview as the qualitative method of snowball and the amount up to the saturation stage. Due to the importance of the research and with the emphasis and consultation of professors and consultants and also according to the method of sample accumulation which has been done in qualitative articles based on samples of similar articles and dissertations, this amount of 10% of the total sample was selected.

Then, in the second step, using the information retrieval method and the interviews, all the findings were entered into the Maxioda text analysis software and the research questions and objectives were analyzed using the Niad data method.

Data-based data theory is also known as grounded theory and fundamental theory and is a general, inductive, and interpretive research strategy developed in 1967 by Glaser and Strauss. This strategy is generally considered to be the best example of an inductive approach. The data-based theory is one of the research strategies through which theory is formed based on the main concepts of data. That is, the process of theory formation in this strategy is the movement of the component to the whole (Danaeifard & Emami, 2007).

This theory creation is not a “shelf and a library” but is based on the data of participants who have experienced a process (Cresswell, 2012) Another definition of data-based theory is a reciprocal inductive, interactive and comparative method to create a theory; That is, the data-

based theory is evolving between data collection and conceptualization.

The theory generated by the data-based theory method has the following characteristics:

- Enables the researcher to explain and explain the subject under study and provides the possibility of predicting possible events in the field of research;
- is effective in developing the theoretical foundations of the subject under study and participates in it;
- In addition to theoretical foundations, it is also used in the practical context of the subject under study;
- Provides a new approach to the subject matter and takes the researcher to a stage of cognition of the data that can give meaning and meaning to the collected data; Facilitates future research in the field. (Mansoorian, 2007)

This theory allows the researcher in various subject areas to formulate a theory and proposition instead of relying on existing and pre-formulated theories. The word grand, in this case, indicates that every theory and proposition that is formulated based on this method is based on a documented context of real data. Grand is a strategy for gaining knowledge about the subject under study and the subject or subjects about which no comprehensive and major research has been done before and our knowledge in that field is limited (Danaeifard & Emami, 2007).

There are three dominant approaches to data-based data theory: the systematic approach, known as Strauss and Corbin; The apparent approach that is related to Glaser’s work and the constructivist approach that is supported by Charmaz.

There are three dominant approaches to data-based data theory: the systematic approach, known as Strauss and Corbin; The apparent approach is related to Glaser’s work and the constructivist approach that is supported by Charmaz. This strategy is based on three elements: “concepts”, “components” and “theorems”. Concepts are the basic units of analysis. Categories can be defined

Table 1. Status of research sample of experts and executive agents. Source: Authors.

Status of members	Number of communities	Percentage under sample	Number of samples	Type of sampling	Sampling technique	Interview time (minutes)
Restaurant	800		80			800
Hotel	240		24			240
Eco-lodge	103		10			100
Travel agency	480	10%	48	Qualitative-snowball	Semi-structured interview	480
Tour guide	400		40			400
Health centers	15		2			20
Total	2038		204			2040

as a summary of a category of concepts. That is, the combination or juxtaposition of several concepts gives rise to a category or class. Categories are the foundations of theory development. The third element is “theorems”, which express the generalized relations between a category and its concepts and between certain categories (*ibid.*).

In central coding, the data-based theorist selects an open-ended coding category, places it at the center of the process under consideration (as a central phenomenon), and then relates the other categories to it. These other categories are: “causal conditions”, “strategies”, “contextual and intervening conditions” and “consequences”. This step involves drawing a diagram called a “coding pattern”. In this template, there are six boxes (or categories) of information:

- Causal conditions: categories related to the conditions that affect the central category;
- Background: Specific conditions that affect strategies;
- The central category: a mental form of the phenomenon that is the basis of the process;
- Intervention contexts: General contextual contexts that influence strategies;
- Strategies: specific actions or interactions that result from a central phenomenon;
- Outcomes: Outputs from the hiring of strategies.

In the axial coding stage, the logical explanation and expression of categories are vital. This is done through the storyline. The storyline is a detailed and detailed explanation of the major categories concerning the notes, summaries, and citations of the people being read.

In selective coding based on the model of the previous step, propositions or explanations are provided that connect the model classes or form a story that connects the model classes. In the advanced case, the researcher completes the work by presenting the status matrix (Cresswell, 2014).

Eventually, the research findings obtained from the qualitative stage became a researcher-made questionnaire and were redistributed among experts and entrepreneurs. After distributing and collecting the questionnaires, the data were entered in SPSS software. The reliability obtained using Cronbach’s alpha coefficient for the designed questionnaire was above 0.7, which indicated the high reliability of the questionnaire questions and the internal correlation of the questions for measuring the research variables. Then, using Friedman’s quantitative prioritization test, the results were analyzed and the most important priorities affecting the entrepreneurial field of health tourism in Mashhad were identified.

Analysis of research findings

In this regard, an attempt has been made to identify the factors affecting the health tourism process in Mashhad

by using semi-structured interviews with entrepreneurs in the field of tourism. What can be examined below are the findings through interviews and analysis of this information based on the data analysis method in MaxQda software.

• Analysis of causal and effective conditions on the process of an entrepreneurial development of health tourism in Mashhad

From the interviewees’ point of view, one of the important and influential reasons for health tourism entrepreneurship in Mashhad is its strategic location and special regional and geographical conditions. Important factors such as being the largest northeastern city in the country, The location of the transportation network (which has the most travel transit after Tehran) and its distance and geographical location in the eastern borders, and the countries located in this axis play an important role in the environmental and macro-level of Mashhad health tourism (Table 2).

According to the results obtained in Table 2, financial and material factors and the way of investment and pricing is the second effective factor that has affected the entrepreneurial process of Mashhad in the field of health tourism. In this regard, the establishment of financial institutions and intermediaries in the field of tourism that can be used as a catalyst in critical situations, as well as the existence of health insurance and facilities and financial assistance in the field of health tourism can be an important organizational factor influencing management and entrepreneurship.

The third influential factor that can be influential in the organizational field and causal conditions is the product and services. In the meantime, diversity and attractiveness in providing health-oriented services, customer satisfaction, uniqueness of health services, the existence of hospitals and health centers with international prestige, the short waiting list to receive services, presence of health-oriented entrepreneurs with international credentials, alternative medicine treatment of incurable diseases, learning Arabic and English instead of Persian in the field of services, implementation of new methods of health and treatment and the existence of strong infrastructure in the field of health tourism are known as effective codes.

• Analysis of intervening and effective conditions on the process of an entrepreneurial development of health tourism in Mashhad

According to the results obtained in Table 3, in the category of intervening conditions, two components of facilitating and inhibiting factors have been involved in the process of the entrepreneurial development of health tourism in Mashhad. Facilitating factors are the same factors that can play a key role in implementing strategies. According to the interview, policy-making and policy-making are two

Table 2. Cluster model of causal factors affecting health-oriented tourism entrepreneurship. Source: Authors.

Category	Component	Indicator	Witness
Causal conditions	Environmental causes	Strategic position to attract tourists	- National, international and national conditions of Mashhad city according to the position of the royal court of Hazrat Reza (AS) - Regional interaction of Mashhad with neighboring countries, especially in border markets in the target countries of the region (Afghanistan, Pakistan, Turkmenistan, etc.)
	Organizational causes	Financing, investing and reducing the cost price	- Enjoying the position of a suitable transportation network (the second transit city in Iran) - Suitable location and favorable geographical distance with other target countries (316 km with Herat, 220 km to Ashgabat) - Establishment of financial intermediary units and institutions in the field of health tourism - Existence of health insurance for health tourists in specific target countries - Establish facilities and financial assistance in the field of health tourism boom - Adopting English and Arabic languages instead of Persian in the field of providing services - Implementing new methods of health and treatment with modern world standards - Attracting and employing health-oriented entrepreneurs with international credentials from other target countries - Shorten the list and waiting time to receive the services of health tourists
		Product and service	- Launch of internationally renowned hotels and health resorts - Exclusion of health services - Adopt programs to promote the satisfaction of health-oriented tourists - Variety in product and attractiveness in service delivery - Existence and creation of strong international infrastructure in the field of health tourism services

effective factors that affect the entrepreneurship strategies of health tourism in Mashhad. The most important known codes in policy-making are the formulation of appropriate strategies with the capacity of health tourism in Mashhad, support for private sector involvement in health tourism, diplomatic relations, and various internal and external consultations that can be identified as major facilitator policies in the field of intervention factors (Table 3).

In this regard, it is necessary to introduce intervention factors that prevent the strategy. According to the interviewees, health-oriented tourism in Mashhad is facing a political factor in the field of entrepreneurship, one of the most important of which is the sanctions that have taken place at the macro and micro levels of the country, as well as in the field of tourism and health. National (presidential elections), local (city council elections) tourism policies, in general, are also affected; Exchange rate fluctuations, which in turn cause distrust of investors and health-oriented tourists, while Khorasan Razavi province due to its location in the eastern part of the country and especially its proximity to Afghanistan was the primary center of immigrants, which to some extent the security of the city. Is affected; All these

factors can negatively affect the employment market and entrepreneurship of Mashhad health tourism.

• **Analysis of background and effective conditions on the process of an entrepreneurial development of health tourism in Mashhad**

As can be seen from the results obtained in Table 4, in the category of contextual conditions, two components of encouraging factors and limiting factors have been involved in the process of the entrepreneurial development of health tourism in Mashhad.

The most important educational factors can be the support of interdisciplinary research that leads to new scientific achievements in the field of tourism and entrepreneurship, specialized training in health tourism with the experiences of top entrepreneurs, raising public awareness of tourism capacities for individuals and investors, launching universities and tourism centers He pointed to the entrepreneurial approach and the exchange and sharing of knowledge to raise citizens' awareness.

Stakeholder cooperation and coordination can also be attributed to factors such as coordinated management

Table 3. Cluster model of intervention factors affecting health-oriented tourism entrepreneurship. Source: Authors.

Category	Component	Indicator	Witness
Interfering conditions	Facilitating factors	Policy Indicator	- Develop an appropriate strategy with health tourism - Supporting the entry of the private sector into health-oriented tourism
	Inhibitory factors	Policy	- Diplomatic communication - Boycott - Political instability - Exchange rate fluctuations - Unsaifty

Table 4. Cluster model of underlying factors affecting health-oriented tourism entrepreneurship. Source: Authors.

Category	Component	Indicator	Witness
Underlying conditions	Incentives	Education	- Supporting interdisciplinary research with an emphasis on modern health tourism - Specialized and practical training of health tourism activists - Promote public awareness of health tourism capacities
	Limiting factors		- Setting up a university, college, virtual institute with a health-oriented entrepreneur tourism approach - Exchange and share of knowledge in the field of health tourism - Coordinated management with health tourism occupations (accommodation, medical, transportation, etc.) - Health-oriented tourism integration - Coordinated integrated management of health-oriented tourism with all stakeholders and stakeholders
		Legal barriers	- Support of large institutions for health-oriented tourism - Lack of legal and coordinated structure in the field of health-oriented tourism - Inefficiency or outdated laws in the field of entrepreneurship and health tourism - Complex administrative bureaucracy in the field of work and health-oriented tourism entrepreneurship

with all tourism businesses that lead to internal integration, integration of tourism services that leads to satisfaction, and facilitation of services. noted the implementation of integrated management with all health tourism stakeholders and government support in this regard.

According to interviews, dates can also affect the legal context of the intervention. The most important signs of this can be the complicated administrative bureaucracy, inefficiency, obsolescence of laws, and the lack of a harmonized law structure.

• Analysis of the main and effective phenomenon on the process of an entrepreneurial development of health tourism in Mashhad

The main or pivotal phenomenon in the field of tourism

entrepreneurship in Mashhad is divided into two dimensions strategic sensitivity and fluidity. The fluidity component has two indicators of mentality and population and the strategic sensitivity component is divided into sustainable tourism development index. Each of the obtained indicators has its variables and evidence, the details of which can be examined in Table 5.

The fluidity component and strategic sensitivity, which are both part of the central phenomena, have three indicators of mentality, population, and strategic sensitivity. These indicators are also influenced by evidence and variables such as tourist insight of services and products, meeting the needs and aging population of the collective growth process, stabilization of natural resources, sustainable use

of capacity, and maintaining ecological balance. Each of these factors can somehow transform the development process of tourism in Mashhad.

• Strategy analysis affecting the process of an entrepreneurial development of health tourism in Mashhad

Strategies are an important step in implementing the model and actions, and all the factors underlying the intervention end up in this category. This aspect is more desirable and important from the implementation point of view. The interviewees mentioned the two main factors of internal and external measures as the first step in implementing the tourism strategy (Table 5).

In their view, indicators such as promoting a culture of work and health-oriented entrepreneurship in tourism and tourism transportation management are the most important external factors and standardization of activities and services is the most important step in implementing internal organizational measures (Table 6).

In the field of work culture and entrepreneurship promotion index, we can see evidence such as supporting industries related to health tourism at home, holding training courses, promoting health tourism and work culture in this field in domestic and foreign TV advertising teasers, developing museums and parks. He related to tourism and mentioned attending the meeting.

Transportation management plays a very important role in the field of health tourism. On the one hand, the employment life of many companies and air, land, and sea tours depends on this industry, and the slightest change can affect the stability of their jobs. Strengths or weaknesses can affect the entire employment and entrepreneurship process of entrepreneurs in this field. The most important evidence of this sector can be taking measures to modernize the transportation fleet, diversify

the rates of transportation services and improve the competitiveness of the transportation industry against competing fashions, as well as classifying the country's airports based on demand.

Standardization of services is also another external indicator in transportation strategies. This index has evidence such as standardization of services and activities, the establishment of quality and ISO standards in companies and institutions related to tourism sending quantitative and qualitative reports to authorities, and obtaining international standards of activity He pointed out the field of tourism, which leads to the promotion of employment and the improvement of the quality of work.

• Analysis of the Impacts on the Entrepreneurial Development Process of Mashhad Health Tourism

In this section, if the basic model is properly formulated, you can see the specific consequences and results of the work. In this regard, the interviewees believed that by identifying the factors affecting entrepreneurship in tourism in Mashhad, we can witness changes at the macro and micro levels.

According to Table 7 Evidence obtained from the analysis of employment and welfare indicators shows the impact of factors such as the development of target economic groups, sustainable entrepreneurship, improving employment, attracting more health tourists, assembling new technologies and economic well-being of local communities in the field of health-oriented tourism. It has been Mashhad.

In terms of the impact of micro-factors, we can see the welfare of the local economy in the cultural heritage of Khorasan Razavi province, because the more economic heritage the cultural welfare has, new jobs are created and the current position of all entrepreneurs in the field of health-oriented tourism is taken from doctors

Table 5. Cluster model The main factors affecting health-oriented tourism entrepreneurship. Source: Authors

Category	Component	Indicator	Witness
The main phenomenon	Being fluid	Mentality	- Tourism mentality and insight into the factors, services and products of health tourism in the destination - Satisfy the need for health tourism from your destination to the destination city
	Strategic sensitivity	population	- Existence of an elderly population in the country Population growth trend - Sustainability of natural resources in health tourism - Sustainable utilization of environmental-local resources and capacities - Maintaining the ecological balance of the region
		Sustainable development of health tourism	

Table 6. Cluster model of strategic factors affecting health-oriented tourism entrepreneurship. Source: Authors.

Category	Component	Indicator	Witness
Strategy	Cultural promotion, promotion and development of work space and entrepreneurship in the field of health tourism	Mentality	- Supporting related industries in the field of health tourism - Holding health-oriented tourism courses - The presence of successful entrepreneurs in the field of health tourism in international, national and local media - Promoting entrepreneurial culture using the media and press capacity of the country - Development of thematic-thematic axes and parks with the field of health - Holding and participating in prestigious scientific and international conferences
	Tourism transportation management with a health-oriented approach	population	- Renovation of suburban and urban transport fleet - Competitiveness in the land and air transportation industry - Diversification of transportation service rates - Route classification-airports-stations and ... in proportion to the volume of service, demand and ... - Standardization of transportation equipment - Establishment of ISO standards and implementation of up-to-date standards in the field of health tourism - Deployment of technical specialists in all units and areas related to health-oriented tourism - Obtaining international standards in the field of treatment
	Standardization of activity and service	Sustainable development of health tourism	

Table 7. Cluster model of consequential factors affecting health-oriented tourism entrepreneurship. Source: Authors

Category	Component	Indicator	Witness
Consequences	Employment creation	Employment creation	- Economic progress in target groups Holding health-oriented tourism courses - Creating employment and efficiency
	Axial welfare	Axial welfare	- Attract more tourists - Assembly of new technologies - Economic well-being of local communities

and nurses. The drivers of the transport fleet of hotel owners etc. will be strengthened.

• **Prioritization based on the opinion of entrepreneurs**
Friedman test was used to determine the priority, which is the final results of the questionnaire distributed among entrepreneurs (Tables 8-11).

Table 8. The distribution of 204 interviews obtained shows that the impact of the components on the entrepreneurial status of health tourism is in the score between 1 and 5. The obtained coefficient of work was equal to 45.563 and the significance level was 001.

This statistical level is in an acceptable range with 95% confidence. To assess this priority, Table 9 uses Friedman Prioritization.

According to Table 9, component prioritization also showed that organizational, strategic, and extra-organizational factors will be three important and influential components on the tourism entrepreneurship situation. However, the components of facilitating factors, limiting factors, and environmental factors had the least impact. Fluidity and motivating factors also have a moderate effect.

Table 8. Study of Friedman statistical coefficient (component prioritization). Source: Authors.

Statistical Coefficient	
Number	204
Coefficient k	45.562
Significance	.001

Table 9. Final results of component prioritization in the questionnaire distributed among entrepreneurs. Source: Authors.

Index type	Average effect on food outcomes (local economy welfare)	Average effect on macro outcomes (employment)	Priority
Environmental causes	18.64	14.63	Sixth
Organizational causes	21.8	22.3	First
Facilitating factors	14.3	16.8	Eighth
Limiting factors	16.7	18.4	Seventh
Incentives	18.7	18.9	Fifth
Strategic sensitivity	21.2	16.9	Second
Being fluid	18.3	19.4	Fourth
Extra-organizational measures	17.69	20.4	Third

Table 10. Study of Friedman statistical coefficient (prioritization of indicators). Source: Authors.

Statistical Coefficient	
Number	204
Coefficient k	56.234
Significance	.000.

Table 11. Final results of prioritization of indicators in the questionnaire distributed among entrepreneurs. Source: Authors.

Index type	Average effect on food outcomes (local economy welfare)	Average effect on macro outcomes (employment)	Priority
Strategic position to attract tourists	18.64	14.63	Fifth
Product and service	14.8	15.18	Eleventh
Financing, investing and reducing the cost price policy	18.3	16.5	Seventh
Legal barriers	14.3	16.8	Tenth
Education	16.7	18.4	Sixth
Coordination and cooperation of stakeholders	19.8	17.2	Second
Sustainable tourism development	17	17.4	Eighth
Population	21.2	16.9	Ninth
Tourism Transportation Management	18.3	19.4	Fourth
Advertising and promoting work culture	23.3	20.2	Third
	20.18	26.1	First

• Prioritization of indicators

Table 10. prioritizes the indicators and the obtained coefficient is equal to 56.234 and the significance level is .000. This statistical level is in the acceptable range

with 95% confidence. To assess this priority, Table 11 of Friedman Prioritization has been used.

According to Table 11, the prioritization of indicators also showed that the product and service index, policy-

making, legal barriers, coordination and cooperation of stakeholders, sustainable tourism development, population, and the promotion of work culture will affect the macro results (employment) of tourism entrepreneurship. Indicators such as strategic position for tourist attraction, financing, investment and cost reduction, and education also affect the development process of micro-entrepreneurship (economic well-being of the local community).

Conclusions

The purpose of this study was to investigate the factors affecting the exploitation of entrepreneurial opportunities for health tourism in Mashhad. In this article, two major research questions have been answered using quantitative and qualitative tools. The most important tool for data collection was interviewing 204 entrepreneurs in the field of medical services to Mashhad in 1400.

The initial question of the research is to measure the components affecting the entrepreneurial process of health tourism. Using interview and text analysis of Max Kiuda, it was obtained that finally all factors were identified in the form of 6 categories, 12 components, 16 indicators, and 66 codes.

The most important components are environmental causes, organizational, facilitator, deterrent, limiting, encouraging, strategic, fluid, extra-organizational, intra-organizational, macro, and micro results. The main categories are known under the influence of these factors, and these factors can create different concepts and indicators. In total, 16 main indicators have been obtained from these 12 components; Strategic position index for tourist attraction, product, and service, financing, investment and cost reduction, policy-making, policy-making, legal barriers, education, coordination and cooperation of stakeholders, sustainable development of health tourism, population, mentality, tourism transportation management, advertising and promotion The culture of work and entrepreneurship includes health-oriented, standardization of activities and services, entrepreneurship and employment, and the welfare of the local economy. Health tourism entrepreneurship in Mashhad is affected by these indicators and these indicators affect the process of health-oriented entrepreneurship.

The results of this study are consistent with the study of Sanavi Grossian, Mirabi, Kordlouyi & Hassanpour (2019) entitled Identifying and ranking the factors affecting the marketing of services in the field of health tourism in Mashhad using fuzzy TOPSIS technique.

The results of this study showed that 13 price and cost factors, codified planning Executive, technical and executive quality of medical services, information system, acceptance and turnover process, customer loyalty, stability and continuity, rules and regulations, international presence, doctor brand, accommodation services, geographical location, the brand of the medical center, speed of service delivery to The order of the most to the least importance in attracting health tourists in the city of Mashhad.

As can be seen, all the factors mentioned in the research of Grossman et al. (2019) in the field of indicators such as price, technical quality, customer, sustainability, laws, brand, doctor, residence, geographical location, and speed of service are consistent with this research. And it is quite consistent in identifying factors.

The findings of several studies show that due to the intense competition in the global arena in providing services at the international level, the country should recognize its tourism capacities and plan accordingly; Therefore, health tourism should look for ways to evaluate the quality of services and improve them. Accuracy of different dimensions and identification of these factors can solve many possible problems.

Friedman's quantitative prioritization test was used to answer the second research question. This test is most effective in SPSS statistical software to prioritize the components. The data of this stage are obtained from the distribution of questionnaires in the target group of experts.

The comparison of the average rankings was 45.563 and the significance level was 001. It can be said that the components affecting the health-oriented entrepreneurship situation in the field of tourism did not have the same effect, but some components were more important. Has been. Examining and prioritizing the components from the perspective of experts shows that the components have had the greatest impact on employment and entrepreneurship and the welfare of the local economy is less affected by intervention factors. The impact of environmental and strategic components will have a greater impact on the state of the local economy, and organizational, facilitating, limiting, encouraging, fluid and extra-organizational factors will affect the welfare of the local tourism economy.

Prioritization of components also showed that organizational, strategic, and extra-organizational factors will be three important and influential components on the entrepreneurial status of tourism. However, the components of facilitating factors, limiting factors, and environmental factors had the least impact.

The results of this research have a conceptual and

semantic similarity with Poloie, Fazli, Dervish Se Talani, Baiat & Ghaderi (2019) in an article entitled "Prioritization of Factors Affecting the Development of Iran's Health Tourism Industry on the Horizon of 2035 with the Interpretive Structure Modeling Approach".

Suggestions

Considering that indicators such as the strategic position of Mashhad city, financing and investment of tourism transportation management, and education are the indicators that have the most impact and compatibility with economic welfare in local communities, a memorandum of understanding between the Ministry of Tourism and the Ministry of Roads and Urban Development is recommended. The Ministry of Interior

should be implemented in the field of development and organization of urban and suburban tourism vehicles. Due to the exhaustion of the fleet and lack of financial credits and investment in this sector, the quality of the fleet does not have the status of a governor and according to many experts, many tourists are reluctant to health tourism in Iran and Mashhad due to fear of this fleet.

According to the results obtained in this study, it is recommended to agree with the Ministry of Tourism and the Radio and Television Organization to broadcast in addition to documents and programs in this field for free or half of the businesses in this field from national and provincial networks. On the other hand, you can create websites or arrange celebrations for the top entrepreneurs in this field.

Reference list

- Brown, G., Smith, A. & Assaker, G. (2016). Revisiting the host city: An empirical examination of sport involvement, place attachment, event satisfaction and spectator intentions at the London Olympics. *Tourism management*, (55), 160-172.
- Busenitz, L. W., Plummer, L. A., Klotz, A. C., Shahzad, A. & Rhoads, K. (2014). Entrepreneurship research (1985–2009) and the emergence of opportunities. *Entrepreneurship Theory and Practice*, 38(5), 1-20.
- Carland, J. W., Hoy, F., Boulton, W. R., et al. (1984). Differentiating entrepreneurs from small business owners: A conceptualization. *Academy of Management Review*, (9), 354-359.
- Chowdhury, M. Prayag, G., Orchiston, C. & Spector, S. (2019). Postdisaster social capital, adaptive resilience and business performance of tourism organizations in Christchurch, New Zealand. *Travel Research*, 58(7), 1209-1226.
- Danaeifard, H. & Emami, S. M. (2007). Qualitative Research Strategies: A Reflection on Data Theory Theory. *Strategic Management Thought*, 1 (2), 69-79.
- *Health at a Glance: Europe 2020: State of Health in the EU Cycle*. (2020). Belgium: OECD Publishing.
- Kirzner, I. M. (1979). *Perception, opportunity, and profit*. Chicago: The University of Chicago.
- Lee, C. (2016). Medical Tourism, an Innovative Opportunity for Entrepreneurs. *Asia Entrepreneurship and Sustainability*, (3), 117-121.
- Maleki, S., & Tavangar, M. (2019). Study and analysis of Mashhad health tourism challenges from the perspective of foreign patients. *Geography and Urban Space Development*, 2 (2), 153-165.
- Moghimehfar, F. & Nasr-Esfahani, M. H. (2011). Decisive factors in medical tourism destination choice: A case study of Isfahan, Iran and fertility treatments. *Tourism Management*, (32), 1431-1434.
- Poloie, K., Fazli, S., Dervish Se Talani, F., Baiat, R. & Ghaderi, I. (2019). Prioritization of factors affecting the development of Iran's health tourism industry on the horizon of 2035 with an interpretive structural modeling approach. *Tourism and development*, 8(3), (consecutive 20), 1-29.
- Rafiei Darani, H. & Barati, J. (2014). The Role of Tourism Industry in Creating Employment in Khorasan Razavi Province. *Tourism Management Studies*, 8(25), 134-139
- Rafiei, F. & Ghamkhar, S. (2016). *Survey of health tourism in Mashhad metropolis*. In The first National Conference on Organizational Transformation and Innovation with a Resistance Economy Approach. Mashhad, Iran..
- Rahmani, H., Arab, M., Saeedpour, G., Rajabi Vasuklai, Q. & Mirzaei, H. (2020). Iranian health tourism market in Pandemic Corona and beyond. *Management Strategies in the Health System*, 5 (3), 165-168.
- Ram, M. & Barrett, G. (2020). Ethnicity and enterprise. In S. Carter & D. JonesEvans (Eds.), *Enterprise and Small Business: Principles, Practice and Policy*. Harlow: Pearson Education.

- Saeed Bakhsh, S., Kazemi, A., Nematbakhsh, M. & Ranjbarian, B. (2020). Designing a medical tourism marketing model of the Islamic Republic with the approach of proposing systems. *Modern Marketing Research*, 10 (2), 105-128.
- Sanavi Grossian V., Mirabi V., Kordloui H. & Hassanpour, I. (2019). Identification and ranking of factors affecting the marketing of services in the field of health tourism in Mashhad using fuzzy TOPSIS technique *Tourism Management Studies. Tourism Studies*, 14(15), 249-269.
- Tourism Research and Marketing. (TRAM). (2008). *Volunteer Tourism: a global analysis*. Arnhem: ATLAS.
- Tsvetkov, T. (2018). Health Tourism in the EU: Facts and Figures. Retrived August 8, 2020, from <https://pro.regiondo.com/health-tourism-eu>.
- World Tourism Organization. (2019). *Draft Manual of a Satellite Account for Tourism*. Retrived August 8, 2020, from [statistics.unwto.org/sites/all/files/docpdf/parti.pdf](https://www.unwto.org/sites/all/files/docpdf/parti.pdf).

COPYRIGHTS

Copyright for this article is retained by the authors with publication rights granted to *Tourism of Culture* journal. This is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).



HOW TO CITE THIS ARTICLE

Mujtabaei, S.; Pishbin, H. A. & khoshab, A. (2022). Identifying the effective factors on exploiting the entrepreneurial opportunities of health tourism in Mashhad. *Tourism of Culture*, 3(8), 5-18.

DOI:10.22034/TOC.2022.322526.1063

URL: http://www.toc-sj.com/article_147237.html?lang=en

